City of Fargo Parking Ramp Concepts Comparison Matrix

helenske design group



ĺ	4/6/2015									
		Site 1 - Warner						Site 2 - St Mark's		
Line #	Parking Ramp Shape	Concept 1-A	Concept 1-B	Concept 1-C	Concept 1-D	Concept 1-E	Concept 1-F	Concept 2-A	Concept 2-B	
1	General Parking Ramp Statistics									
2	Number of Ramp Spaces	608	573	584	623	565	629	616	641	
3	Existing Parking Public or Private	Private	Private	Private	Private	Private	Private	Private	Private	
4	Existing Parking Spaces Displaced	93	93	93	93	93	93	106	104	
5 6	Net Gain of Spaces = Dimensions of Parking Ramp	515 124' X 297'	480 124' X 250'	491 124' X 290'	530 114' X 292'	472 124' X 200'	536 124' X 200' +	510 124' X 215'	537 114' X 290'	
7	Ramping System	Single Threaded Helix	Single Threaded Helix	Single Threaded Helix	Double Threaded Helix	Single Threaded Helix	122' X 166' Single Threaded Helix	Single Threaded Helix	Double Threaded Heli	
8	Basement Level (Y/N)	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ	
9	Number of Levels Above Grade	4	4	4	4.5	6	4	6	4.5	
10	Total Number of Levels	6	6	6	6.5	8	6	8	6.5	
11 12	Parking Efficiency Total Parking Ramp Area (SF)	205,350	195,200	200,150	203,050	195,300	243,300	209,250	207,000	
13	Total Street Level Commercial Area (SF) Inside Parking Structure	10,660	0	8,190	9,640	0	35,400	0	0	
14	Total Area (SF) =	216,010	195,200	208,340	212,690	195,300	278,700	209,250	207,000	
15	Parking Ramp Efficiency (Sq. Ft./Space)	338	341	343	326	346	387	340	323	
16	Property Status									
17	Land Ownership	Private X 2	Private X 2	Private X 2	Private X 2	Private X 2	Private X 2	Private	Private X 2	
18 19	Property Acquisition Issues Parking Demand in Site Influence Area (2-Blocks in Each Direction)	Yes X 2	Yes X 2	Yes X 2	Yes X 2	TBD	Yes X 2	Yes	Yes X 2	
20	Existing Influence Area Surplus / (Deficit)									
21	Estimated Future Influence Area Surplus / (Deficit)									
22	General Items									
23	User Comfort and Convenience of Circulation & Ramping System	Excellent	Excelent	Excellent	Okay	Good	Fair	Good	Fair	
24 25	Distance from Elevator to 2nd Ave. & Broadway Central Intersection Skywalk Adjacency?	3 Blocks No	3 Blocks No	3 Blocks No	3 Blocks No	3 Blocks No	3 Blocks No	3 Blocks No	3 Blocks No	
25 26	Skywalk Adjacency? Potential Spin Off Opportunities (H=Housing, I=Institutional, C=Commercial & Retail)	No H & C	No H & C	No H & C	No H & C	No H & C	No H & C	No H & I	No H & I	
27	Liner Building Floor Area (Levels/Area)									
28	Concept at Appropriate Contextual Height?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	
29	Architectural Treatment of Sloping Floor Facing Toward Street	North Side	South Side	North Side	North & South Sides			East & West Sides		
30	Site Area (If > 1 Acre then On-Site Storm Water Mgmt Required)	1.31 ac	1.31 ac	1.31 ac	1.31 ac	1.31 ac	1.31 ac	.83 ac	1.17 ac	
31 32	Overhead Electric Power Line Impacts? Future Parking Expansion Capability (Horz. Or Vertical)	Yes Vertical	Yes Vertical	Yes Vertical	Yes Vertical	Yes None	Yes Vertical	No None	No Vert. & Horz.	
33	Traffic Access	v Ci iiodi	v Ci iiodi	v GI IIUdi	v Gruodi	INOTIC	v Gruodi	NONE	voit. ox FIUIZ.	
34	Convenient Traffic Access for Users?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	
35	Traffic Access Congestion?	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	
36	Entry Lane Street Access	4th Ave. N	4th Ave. N	4th Ave. N	5th St. N	4th Ave. N	4th Ave. N & Depot	7th St. N	Roberts & 7th St. N	
37	Exit Lane Street Access	4th Ave. N	4th Ave. N	4th Ave. N	5th St. N	4th Ave. N	4th Ave. N & Depot	7th St. N	7th St. N	
38 39	Vertical Circulation 12% Express (Non-parking) Ramp Area (SF)	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	3%	0%	0%	
40	Parking Ramp Slopes	5.5%-6.0%	2.0%-5.1%	5.7%-6.0%	5.2%-6.0%	5.2%	5.2%-12.0%	4.5%-4.8%	5.3%	
41	Floor Elevation of Top Level (Feet)	46.50	57.83	46.50	51.00	68.00	53.67	73.33	52.92	
42	Parapet Elevation of Top Level (Feet)	50.25	61.58	50.25	54.75	71.75	57.42	77.09	56.67	
43	Percentage of Area on Non-Ramping Floors @ Typ. Level	69%	26%	69%	26%	48%	50%	43%	25%	
44 45	Dead End(s) Parking Geometrics & Circulation	2	2	2	0	2	2	2	0	
45 46	Number of Bays	2	2	2	2	2	4	2	2	
47	Angle of Parking	90 Degree	90 Degree	90 Degree	75 Degree	90 Degree	90 Degree	90 Degree	75 Degree	
48	1-Way or 2-Way Traffic Flow	2 Way	2 Way	2 Way	1 Way	2 Way	2 Way	2 Way	1 Way	
49										
50	Site Comparative Ranking for Satisfying the Parking Demand of the Downtown C	_	-	_	_	_	_	-		
51 52	Site Ranking (1 = Best & 7 = Worst) Comments	2	2	2	2	2	2	6	4	
52	Concentual Comparative Construction Cost									
53 54	Conceptual Comparative Construction Cost Parking Ramp Construction Cost									
		52.50	52.50	52.50	52.50	52.50	52.50	52.50	52.50	
54	Parking Ramp Construction Cost	52.50	52.50	52.50	52.50	52.50	52.50 2.75	52.50	52.50	
54 55 56 57	Parking Ramp Construction Cost Base Parking Ramp Unit Cost (\$/SF) ² Premium for Vertical Development (\$/SF) Base Parking Ramp Cost	\$10,780,875	\$10,248,000	\$10,507,875	\$10,660,125	\$10,253,250	2.75 \$13,442,325	\$10,985,625	\$10,867,500	
54 55 56 57 58	Parking Ramp Construction Cost Base Parking Ramp Unit Cost (\$/SF) ² Premium for Vertical Development (\$/SF) Base Parking Ramp Cost Street Level Commercial Shell Cost at \$80/SF	\$10,780,875 \$852,800	\$10,248,000 \$0	\$10,507,875 \$655,200	\$10,660,125 \$771,200	\$10,253,250 \$0	2.75 \$13,442,325 \$2,832,000	\$10,985,625 \$0	\$10,867,500 \$0	
54 55 56 57 58 59	Parking Ramp Construction Cost Base Parking Ramp Unit Cost (\$/SF) ² Premium for Vertical Development (\$/SF) Base Parking Ramp Cost Street Level Commercial Shell Cost at \$80/SF Below Grade Premium	\$10,780,875 \$852,800 26.30	\$10,248,000 \$0 26.30	\$10,507,875 \$655,200 26.30	\$10,660,125 \$771,200 26.30	\$10,253,250 \$0 26.30	2.75 \$13,442,325 \$2,832,000 26.30	\$10,985,625 \$0 26.30	\$10,867,500 \$0 26.30	
54 55 56 57 58	Parking Ramp Construction Cost Base Parking Ramp Unit Cost (\$/SF) ² Premium for Vertical Development (\$/SF) Base Parking Ramp Cost Street Level Commercial Shell Cost at \$80/SF	\$10,780,875 \$852,800	\$10,248,000 \$0	\$10,507,875 \$655,200	\$10,660,125 \$771,200	\$10,253,250 \$0	2.75 \$13,442,325 \$2,832,000	\$10,985,625 \$0	\$10,867,500 \$0	
54 55 56 57 58 59 60	Parking Ramp Construction Cost Base Parking Ramp Unit Cost (\$/SF) ² Premium for Vertical Development (\$/SF) Base Parking Ramp Cost Street Level Commercial Shell Cost at \$80/SF Below Grade Premium Footprint Area for Below Grade	\$10,780,875 \$852,800 26.30 36,800	\$10,248,000 \$0 26.30 12,600	\$10,507,875 \$655,200 26.30 36,000	\$10,660,125 \$771,200 26.30 33,300	\$10,253,250 \$0 26.30 24,800	2.75 \$13,442,325 \$2,832,000 26.30 45,100	\$10,985,625 \$0 26.30 26,700	\$10,867,500 \$0 26.30 33,100	
54 55 56 57 58 59 60 61	Parking Ramp Construction Cost Base Parking Ramp Unit Cost (\$/SF) ² Premium for Vertical Development (\$/SF) Base Parking Ramp Cost Street Level Commercial Shell Cost at \$80/SF Below Grade Premium Footprint Area for Below Grade Below Grade Cost Premium	\$10,780,875 \$852,800 26.30 36,800 \$967,840	\$10,248,000 \$0 26.30 12,600 \$331,380	\$10,507,875 \$655,200 26.30 36,000 \$946,800	\$10,660,125 \$771,200 26.30 33,300 \$875,790	\$10,253,250 \$0 26.30 24,800 \$652,240	2.75 \$13,442,325 \$2,832,000 26.30 45,100 \$1,186,130	\$10,985,625 \$0 26.30 26,700 \$702,210	\$10,867,500 \$0 26.30 33,100 \$870,530	
54 55 56 57 58 59 60 61 62 63 64	Parking Ramp Construction Cost Base Parking Ramp Unit Cost (\$/SF)^2 Premium for Vertical Development (\$/SF) Base Parking Ramp Cost Street Level Commercial Shell Cost at \$80/SF Below Grade Premium Footprint Area for Below Grade Below Grade Cost Premium Storm Water Management System Allowance (\$250k/acre) Façade Area (SF) Façade Premium Cost at \$30/SF	\$10,780,875 \$852,800 26.30 36,800 \$967,840 \$327,500	\$10,248,000 \$0 26.30 12,600 \$331,380 \$327,500	\$10,507,875 \$655,200 26.30 36,000 \$946,800 \$327,500	\$10,660,125 \$771,200 26.30 33,300 \$875,790 \$327,500	\$10,253,250 \$0 26.30 24,800 \$652,240 \$327,500	2.75 \$13,442,325 \$2,832,000 26.30 45,100 \$1,186,130 \$327,500	\$10,985,625 \$0 26.30 26,700 \$702,210 \$0	\$10,867,500 \$0 26.30 33,100 \$870,530 \$292,500	
54 55 56 57 58 59 60 61 62 63 64 65	Parking Ramp Construction Cost Base Parking Ramp Unit Cost (\$/SF)^2 Premium for Vertical Development (\$/SF) Base Parking Ramp Cost Street Level Commercial Shell Cost at \$80/SF Below Grade Premium Footprint Area for Below Grade Below Grade Cost Premium Storm Water Management System Allowance (\$250k/acre) Façade Area (SF) Façade Premium Cost at \$30/SF Site Work Construction Cost	\$10,780,875 \$852,800 26.30 36,800 \$967,840 \$327,500 27,400 \$822,000	\$10,248,000 \$0 26.30 12,600 \$331,380 \$327,500 23,000 \$690,000	\$10,507,875 \$655,200 26.30 36,000 \$946,800 \$327,500 27,000 \$810,000	\$10,660,125 \$771,200 26.30 33,300 \$875,790 \$327,500 28,500 \$855,000	\$10,253,250 \$0 26.30 24,800 \$652,240 \$327,500 32,100 \$963,000	2.75 \$13,442,325 \$2,832,000 26.30 45,100 \$1,186,130 \$327,500 42,400 \$1,272,000	\$10,985,625 \$0 26.30 26,700 \$702,210 \$0 42,700 \$1,281,000	\$10,867,500 \$0 26.30 33,100 \$870,530 \$292,500 26,900 \$807,000	
54 55 56 57 58 59 60 61 62 63 64 65 66	Parking Ramp Construction Cost Base Parking Ramp Unit Cost (\$/SF)^2 Premium for Vertical Development (\$/SF) Base Parking Ramp Cost Street Level Commercial Shell Cost at \$80/SF Below Grade Premium Footprint Area for Below Grade Below Grade Cost Premium Storm Water Management System Allowance (\$250k/acre) Façade Area (SF) Façade Premium Cost at \$30/SF Site Work Construction Cost Demolition of Parking Lot at \$250/space	\$10,780,875 \$852,800 26.30 36,800 \$967,840 \$327,500 27,400 \$822,000	\$10,248,000 \$0 26.30 12,600 \$331,380 \$327,500 23,000 \$690,000	\$10,507,875 \$655,200 26.30 36,000 \$946,800 \$327,500 27,000 \$810,000	\$10,660,125 \$771,200 26.30 33,300 \$875,790 \$327,500 28,500 \$855,000	\$10,253,250 \$0 26.30 24,800 \$652,240 \$327,500 32,100 \$963,000	2.75 \$13,442,325 \$2,832,000 26.30 45,100 \$1,186,130 \$327,500 42,400 \$1,272,000	\$10,985,625 \$0 26.30 26,700 \$702,210 \$0 42,700	\$10,867,500 \$0 26.30 33,100 \$870,530 \$292,500 26,900	
54 55 56 57 58 59 60 61 62 63 64 65 66 67	Parking Ramp Construction Cost Base Parking Ramp Unit Cost (\$/SF)^2 Premium for Vertical Development (\$/SF) Base Parking Ramp Cost Street Level Commercial Shell Cost at \$80/SF Below Grade Premium Footprint Area for Below Grade Below Grade Cost Premium Storm Water Management System Allowance (\$250k/acre) Façade Area (SF) Façade Premium Cost at \$30/SF Site Work Construction Cost Demolition of Parking Lot at \$250/space Demolition of Existing Building(s)	\$10,780,875 \$852,800 26.30 36,800 \$967,840 \$327,500 27,400 \$822,000 \$23,250 \$35,400	\$10,248,000 \$0 26.30 12,600 \$331,380 \$327,500 23,000 \$690,000 \$23,250 \$35,400	\$10,507,875 \$655,200 26.30 36,000 \$946,800 \$327,500 27,000 \$810,000	\$10,660,125 \$771,200 26.30 33,300 \$875,790 \$327,500 28,500 \$855,000 \$23,250 \$35,400	\$10,253,250 \$0 26.30 24,800 \$652,240 \$327,500 32,100 \$963,000 \$23,250 \$35,400	2.75 \$13,442,325 \$2,832,000 26.30 45,100 \$1,186,130 \$327,500 42,400 \$1,272,000 \$23,250 \$35,400	\$10,985,625 \$0 26.30 26,700 \$702,210 \$0 42,700 \$1,281,000	\$10,867,500 \$0 26.30 33,100 \$870,530 \$292,500 26,900 \$807,000	
54 55 56 57 58 59 60 61 62 63 64 65 66	Parking Ramp Construction Cost Base Parking Ramp Unit Cost (\$/SF)^2 Premium for Vertical Development (\$/SF) Base Parking Ramp Cost Street Level Commercial Shell Cost at \$80/SF Below Grade Premium Footprint Area for Below Grade Below Grade Cost Premium Storm Water Management System Allowance (\$250k/acre) Façade Area (SF) Façade Premium Cost at \$30/SF Site Work Construction Cost Demolition of Parking Lot at \$250/space	\$10,780,875 \$852,800 26.30 36,800 \$967,840 \$327,500 27,400 \$822,000	\$10,248,000 \$0 26.30 12,600 \$331,380 \$327,500 23,000 \$690,000	\$10,507,875 \$655,200 26.30 36,000 \$946,800 \$327,500 27,000 \$810,000	\$10,660,125 \$771,200 26.30 33,300 \$875,790 \$327,500 28,500 \$855,000	\$10,253,250 \$0 26.30 24,800 \$652,240 \$327,500 32,100 \$963,000	2.75 \$13,442,325 \$2,832,000 26.30 45,100 \$1,186,130 \$327,500 42,400 \$1,272,000	\$10,985,625 \$0 26.30 26,700 \$702,210 \$0 42,700 \$1,281,000	\$10,867,500 \$0 26.30 33,100 \$870,530 \$292,500 26,900 \$807,000	
54 55 56 57 58 59 60 61 62 63 64 65 66 67 68	Parking Ramp Construction Cost Base Parking Ramp Unit Cost (\$/SF)^2 Premium for Vertical Development (\$/SF) Base Parking Ramp Cost Street Level Commercial Shell Cost at \$80/SF Below Grade Premium Footprint Area for Below Grade Below Grade Cost Premium Storm Water Management System Allowance (\$250k/acre) Façade Area (SF) Façade Premium Cost at \$30/SF Site Work Construction Cost Demolition of Parking Lot at \$250/space Demolition of Existing Building(s) Total Parking Ramp Construction Cost =	\$10,780,875 \$852,800 26.30 36,800 \$967,840 \$327,500 27,400 \$822,000 \$23,250 \$35,400 \$13,809,665	\$10,248,000 \$0 26.30 12,600 \$331,380 \$327,500 23,000 \$690,000 \$23,250 \$35,400 \$11,655,530	\$10,507,875 \$655,200 26.30 36,000 \$946,800 \$327,500 27,000 \$810,000 \$23,250 \$35,400 \$13,306,025	\$10,660,125 \$771,200 26.30 33,300 \$875,790 \$327,500 28,500 \$855,000 \$23,250 \$35,400 \$13,548,265	\$10,253,250 \$0 26.30 24,800 \$652,240 \$327,500 32,100 \$963,000 \$23,250 \$35,400 \$12,254,640	2.75 \$13,442,325 \$2,832,000 26.30 45,100 \$1,186,130 \$327,500 42,400 \$1,272,000 \$23,250 \$35,400 \$19,118,605	\$10,985,625 \$0 26.30 26,700 \$702,210 \$0 42,700 \$1,281,000 \$26,500	\$10,867,500 \$0 26.30 33,100 \$870,530 \$292,500 26,900 \$807,000 \$12,863,530	
54 55 56 57 58 59 60 61 62 63 64 65 66 67 68	Parking Ramp Construction Cost Base Parking Ramp Unit Cost (\$/SF)^2 Premium for Vertical Development (\$/SF) Base Parking Ramp Cost Street Level Commercial Shell Cost at \$80/SF Below Grade Premium Footprint Area for Below Grade Below Grade Cost Premium Storm Water Management System Allowance (\$250k/acre) Façade Area (SF) Façade Premium Cost at \$30/SF Site Work Construction Cost Demolition of Parking Lot at \$250/space Demolition of Existing Building(s) Total Parking Ramp Construction Cost = Total Parking Ramp Cost per SF =	\$10,780,875 \$852,800 26.30 36,800 \$967,840 \$327,500 27,400 \$822,000 \$23,250 \$35,400 \$13,809,665 \$63.93 \$22,713 \$26,815	\$10,248,000 \$0 26.30 12,600 \$331,380 \$327,500 23,000 \$690,000 \$23,250 \$35,400 \$11,655,530 \$59,71	\$10,507,875 \$655,200 26.30 36,000 \$946,800 \$327,500 27,000 \$810,000 \$23,250 \$35,400 \$13,306,025 \$63.87	\$10,660,125 \$771,200 26.30 33,300 \$875,790 \$327,500 28,500 \$855,000 \$23,250 \$35,400 \$13,548,265 \$63.70	\$10,253,250 \$0 26.30 24,800 \$652,240 \$327,500 32,100 \$963,000 \$23,250 \$35,400 \$12,254,640 \$62.75	2.75 \$13,442,325 \$2,832,000 26.30 45,100 \$1,186,130 \$327,500 42,400 \$1,272,000 \$23,250 \$35,400 \$19,118,605 \$68.60	\$10,985,625 \$0 26.30 26,700 \$702,210 \$0 42,700 \$1,281,000 \$26,500 \$12,995,335 \$62.10	\$10,867,500 \$0 26.30 33,100 \$870,530 \$292,500 26,900 \$807,000 \$12,863,530 \$62.14	
54 55 56 57 58 59 60 61 62 63 64 65 66 67 68 69 70	Parking Ramp Construction Cost Base Parking Ramp Unit Cost (\$/SF)^2 Premium for Vertical Development (\$/SF) Base Parking Ramp Cost Street Level Commercial Shell Cost at \$80/SF Below Grade Premium Footprint Area for Below Grade Below Grade Cost Premium Storm Water Management System Allowance (\$250k/acre) Façade Area (SF) Façade Premium Cost at \$30/SF Site Work Construction Cost Demolition of Parking Lot at \$250/space Demolition of Existing Building(s) Total Parking Ramp Construction Cost = Total Parking Ramp Cost per SF = Cost Per Ramp Parking Space (Including Commercial) = Cost Per Net Parking Space (Including Commercial) = Preliminary Soft Costs (@ 15%)= 1	\$10,780,875 \$852,800 26.30 36,800 \$967,840 \$327,500 27,400 \$822,000 \$23,250 \$35,400 \$13,809,665 \$63.93 \$22,713 \$26,815 \$2,071,400	\$10,248,000 \$0 26.30 12,600 \$331,380 \$327,500 23,000 \$690,000 \$23,250 \$35,400 \$11,655,530 \$59.71 \$20,341 \$24,282 \$1,748,300	\$10,507,875 \$655,200 26.30 36,000 \$946,800 \$327,500 27,000 \$810,000 \$23,250 \$35,400 \$13,306,025 \$63.87 \$22,784 \$27,100 \$1,995,900	\$10,660,125 \$771,200 26.30 33,300 \$875,790 \$327,500 28,500 \$855,000 \$23,250 \$35,400 \$13,548,265 \$63.70 \$21,747 \$25,563 \$2,032,200	\$10,253,250 \$0 26.30 24,800 \$652,240 \$327,500 32,100 \$963,000 \$23,250 \$35,400 \$12,254,640 \$62.75 \$21,690 \$25,963 \$1,838,200	2.75 \$13,442,325 \$2,832,000 26.30 45,100 \$1,186,130 \$327,500 42,400 \$1,272,000 \$23,250 \$35,400 \$19,118,605 \$68.60 \$30,395 \$35,669 \$2,867,800	\$10,985,625 \$0 26.30 26,700 \$702,210 \$0 42,700 \$1,281,000 \$26,500 \$12,995,335 \$62.10 \$21,096 \$25,481 \$1,949,300	\$10,867,500 \$0 26.30 33,100 \$870,530 \$292,500 26,900 \$807,000 \$26,000 \$12,863,530 \$62.14 \$20,068 \$23,954 \$1,929,500	
54 55 56 57 58 59 60 61 62 63 64 65 66 67 68 69 70	Parking Ramp Construction Cost Base Parking Ramp Unit Cost (\$/SF)² Premium for Vertical Development (\$/SF) Base Parking Ramp Cost Street Level Commercial Shell Cost at \$80/SF Below Grade Premium Footprint Area for Below Grade Below Grade Cost Premium Storm Water Management System Allowance (\$250k/acre) Façade Area (SF) Façade Premium Cost at \$30/SF Site Work Construction Cost Demolition of Parking Lot at \$250/space Demolition of Existing Building(s) Total Parking Ramp Construction Cost = Total Parking Ramp Construction Cost = Cost Per Ramp Parking Space (Including Commercial) = Cost Per Net Parking Space (Including Commercial) =	\$10,780,875 \$852,800 26.30 36,800 \$967,840 \$327,500 27,400 \$822,000 \$23,250 \$35,400 \$13,809,665 \$63.93 \$22,713 \$26,815	\$10,248,000 \$0 26.30 12,600 \$331,380 \$327,500 23,000 \$690,000 \$23,250 \$35,400 \$11,655,530 \$59.71 \$20,341 \$24,282	\$10,507,875 \$655,200 26.30 36,000 \$946,800 \$327,500 27,000 \$810,000 \$23,250 \$35,400 \$13,306,025 \$63.87 \$22,784 \$27,100	\$10,660,125 \$771,200 26.30 33,300 \$875,790 \$327,500 28,500 \$855,000 \$23,250 \$35,400 \$13,548,265 \$63.70 \$21,747 \$25,563	\$10,253,250 \$0 26.30 24,800 \$652,240 \$327,500 32,100 \$963,000 \$23,250 \$35,400 \$12,254,640 \$62.75 \$21,690 \$25,963	2.75 \$13,442,325 \$2,832,000 26.30 45,100 \$1,186,130 \$327,500 42,400 \$1,272,000 \$23,250 \$35,400 \$19,118,605 \$68.60 \$30,395 \$35,669	\$10,985,625 \$0 26.30 26,700 \$702,210 \$0 42,700 \$1,281,000 \$26,500 \$12,995,335 \$62.10 \$21,096 \$25,481	\$10,867,500 \$0 26.30 33,100 \$870,530 \$292,500 26,900 \$807,000 \$26,000 \$12,863,530 \$62.14 \$20,068 \$23,954	

Notes:

- 1. Excludes land acquisition and City of Fargo administration, legal, and financing costs.
- 2. Assumes March 2016 start of construction.

City of Fargo Parking Ramp Concepts Comparison Matrix

helenske design group



4/6/2015

i	/2015								
				- 2nd Avenue				- 2nd Avenue	
		Concept 3-A	Concept 3-B	Concept 3-C	Concept 3-D	Concept 3-E	Concept 4-A	Concept 4-B	Concept 4-C
1:	Bartina Barra Chara								
Line #	Parking Ramp Shape								
1	General Parking Ramp Statistics								
2	Number of Ramp Spaces	452	474	526	587	575	288	490	478
3	Existing Parking Public or Private	Public	Public	Public/Private	Public/Private	Public/Private	Public	Public/Private	Public/Private
4	Existing Parking Spaces Displaced	100	100	132	132	132	65	107	107
5	Net Gain of Spaces =	352	374	394	455	443	223	383 136' X 140' +	371 136' X 140' +
6 7	Dimensions of Parking Ramp Ramping System	124' X 175' Single Threaded Helix	176' X 175' Side by Side Helix	124' X 225' Single Threaded Helix	176' X 225' Side by Side Helix	176' X 225' Side by Side Helix	136' X 140' Single Threaded Helix	64' X 150' Single Threaded Helix	64' X 150' Single Threaded Helix
8	Basement Level (Y/N)	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	N	N	Y
9	Number of Levels Above Grade	6	5	5	4	4	7	7	5
10	Total Number of Levels	8	7	7	6	6	8	8	7
	Parking Efficiency								
12 13	Total Parking Ramp Area (SF) Total Street Level Commercial Area (SF) Inside Parking Structure	167,810 3,240	194,475 17,825	181,470 4,830	208,260 16,640	211,760 10,660	132,200 3,290	194,910 3,290	190,000
14	Total Area (SF) =	171,050	212,300	186,300	224,900	222,420	135,490	198,200	190,000
15	Parking Ramp Efficiency (Sq. Ft./Space)	371	410	345	355	368	459	398	397
16	Property Status								
17	Land Ownership	Public	Public	Public/Private	Public/Private	Public/Private	Public	Public/Private	Public/Private
18	Property Acquisition Issues	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
19 20	Parking Demand in Site Influence Area (2-Blocks in Each Direction) Existing Influence Area Surplus / (Deficit)								
	Estimated Future Influence Area Surplus / (Deficit)								
22	General Items								
23	User Comfort and Convenience of Circulation & Ramping System	Okay	Okay	Good	Good	Good	Poor	Poor	Poor
24	Distance from Elevator to 2nd Ave. & Broadway Central Intersection	1.5 Blocks	0.5 Block	1.5 Blocks	0.5 Block	0.5 Block	0.5 Block	0.5 Block	0.5 Block
25	Skywalk Adjacency?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
26 27	Potential Spin Off Opportunities (H=Housing, I=Institutional, C=Commercial & Retail) Liner Building Floor Area (Levels/Area)	H, I & C	H, I & C	H, I & C	H, I & C	H, I & C	H & I	H & I	H & I
28	Concept at Appropriate Contextual Height?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
29	Architectural Treatment of Sloping Floor Facing Toward Street		East & West Sides				All Four Sides	Three Sides	Three Sides
30	Site Area (If > 1 Acre then On-Site Storm Water Mgmt Required)	.77 ac	.77 ac	.97 ac	.97 ac	.97 ac	.5 ac	.73 ac	.73 ac
	Overhead Electric Power Line Impacts?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
32	Future Parking Expansion Capability (Horz. Or Vertical)	Horizontal	Vert. & Horz.	Vert. & Horz.	Vert. & Horz.	Vert. & Horz.	Horizontal	None	None
33 34	Traffic Access Convenient Traffic Access for Users?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
34 35	Convenient Tranic Access for Users? Traffic Access Congestion?	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	No	No	No
36	Entry Lane Street Access	2nd Ave. N	2nd Ave. N & Roberts	Roberts St. N	Roberts St. N	2nd Ave. N & Roberts	2nd Ave. N	2nd Ave. N	2nd Ave. N
37	Exit Lane Street Access	2nd Ave. N	2nd Ave. N & Roberts	Roberts St. N	Roberts St. N	2nd Ave. N & Roberts	2nd Ave. N	2nd Ave. N	2nd Ave. N
38	Vertical Circulation								
39 40	12% Express (Non-parking) Ramp Area (SF)	0% 5.7% 6.0%	7%	0%	0%	4%	0%	0%	0%
40 41	Parking Ramp Slopes Floor Elevation of Top Level (Feet)	5.7%-6.0% 74.33	5.0%-12.0% 65.00	4.2%-5.0% 58.67	2.0%-5.0%-6.3% 54.00	5.5%-6.0% 54.67	2.0%-5.4% 82.00	2.0%-5.4% 82.00	2.0%-5.4% 56.67
42	Parapet Elevation of Top Level (Feet)	78.08	68.75	61.42	57.75	58.42	85.75	85.75	60.42
43	Percentage of Area on Non-Ramping Floors @ Typ. Level	41%	29%	37%	31%	30%	34%	50%	50%
44	Dead End(s)	2	0	2	0	2	2	2	2
45	Parking Geometrics & Circulation	_	_	_	-	_	_	-	_
46 47	Number of Bays Apple of Parking	2 90 Degree	3 75/90 Degree	2 90 Degree	3 75/90 Degree	75/90 Degree	2 90 Degree	2 90 Degree	2 90 Degree
47 48	Angle of Parking 1-Way or 2-Way Traffic Flow	90 Degree 2 Way	75/90 Degree 1 Way/2 Way	90 Degree 2 Way	1 Way/2 Way	1 Way/2 Way	90 Degree 2 Way	90 Degree 2 Way	90 Degree 2 Way
49			y	· · y		y			:: <i>⇒</i> y
50	Site Comparative Ranking for Satisfying the Parking Demand of the Downtown Co	ore Parking							
	Site Ranking (1 = Best & 7 = Worst)	1	1	1	1	1	6	6	6
52	Comments								
<u>.</u> .									
53 54	Conceptual Comparative Construction Cost Parking Ramp Construction Cost								
	Base Parking Ramp Unit Cost (\$/SF) ²	52.50	52.50	52.50	52.50	52.50	55.15	55.15	55.15
56	Premium for Vertical Development (\$/SF)		2.75		2.75	2.75	2.75	2.75	2.75
57	Base Parking Ramp Cost	\$8,810,025	\$10,744,744	\$9,527,175	\$11,506,365	\$11,699,740	\$7,654,380	\$11,285,289	\$11,001,000
58	Street Level Commercial Shell Cost at \$80/SF	\$259,200	\$1,426,000	\$386,400	\$1,331,200	\$852,800	\$263,200	\$263,200	\$0
	Below Grade Premium	26.30	26.30	26.30	26.30	26.30	27.60	27.60	27.60
60 61	Footprint Area for Below Grade Below Grade Cost Premium	21,700 \$570,710	30,800 \$810,040	31,600 \$831,080	39,600 \$1,041,480	39,600 \$1,041,480	19,000 \$524,400	28,600 \$789,360	28,600 \$789,360
62	Storm Water Management System Allowance (\$250k/acre)	\$0	\$0	\$250,000	\$250,000	\$250,000	\$0	\$0	\$0
63	Façade Area (SF)	33,000	36,200	29,100	33,300	33,700	11,700	30,000	21,100
64	Façade Premium Cost at \$30/SF	\$990,000	\$1,086,000	\$873,000	\$999,000	\$1,011,000	\$351,000	\$900,000	\$633,000
	Site Work Construction Cost								
66 67	Demolition of Parking Lot at \$250/space	\$25,000	\$25,000	\$33,000	\$33,000	\$33,000	\$16,250	\$26,750	\$26,750
67 68	Demolition of Existing Building(s) Total Parking Ramp Construction Cost =	\$10,654,935	\$14,091,784	\$11,900,655	\$15,161,045	\$14,888,020	\$8,809,230	\$13,264,599	\$12,450,110
69	Total Parking Ramp Cost per SF =	\$62.29	\$66.38	\$63.88	\$67.41	\$66.94	\$65.02	\$66.93	\$65.53
70	Cost Per Ramp Parking Space (Including Commercial) =	\$23,573	\$29,730	\$22,625	\$25,828	\$25,892	\$30,588	\$27,071	\$26,046
71	Cost Per Net Parking Space (Including Commercial) =	\$30,270	\$37,679	\$30,205	\$33,321	\$33,607	\$39,503	\$34,633	\$33,558
72	Preliminary Soft Costs (@ 15%)= 1	\$1,598,200	\$2,113,800	\$1,785,100	\$2,274,200	\$2,233,200	\$1,321,400	\$1,989,700	\$1,867,500 \$373,500
73	Owners Construction Phase Contingency (@ 3%) = Conceptual Design Cost Contingency (@ 10%) =	\$319,600 \$1,065,500	\$422,800 \$1,409,200	\$357,000 \$1,190,100	\$454,800 \$1,516,100	\$446,600 \$1,488,800	\$264,300 \$880,900	\$397,900 \$1,326,500	\$373,500 \$1,245,000
73 74	Total Project Cost =	\$1,005,500 \$13,638,235	\$1,409,200 \$18,037,584	\$1,190,100 \$15,232,855	\$1,516,100 \$19,406,145	\$1,466,600 \$19,056,620	\$11,275,830	\$1,326,500 \$16,978,699	\$1,245,000 \$15,936,110
	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,								

Notes

- Excludes land acquisition and City of Fargo administration, legal, and financing costs.
- 2. Assumes March 2016 start of construction.

City of Fargo Parking Ramp Concepts Comparison Matrix





4/6/2015 Site 5 - Civic Ctr Ramp Site 6 - City Hall Site 7 - NP Avenue Concept 5-A Concept 5-B Concept 6-A Concept 7-A Concept 7-B Concept 7-D Line # Parking Ramp Shape **General Parking Ramp Statistics** 155 Number of Ramp Spaces 79 553 493 504 626 572 2 3 xisting Parking Public or Private Public Public Public Public Public Public/Private Public/Private xisting Parking Spaces Displaced 172 145 145 5 Net Gain of Spaces = 147 381 348 359 378 324 Dimensions of Parking Ramp 107.75' x 236.25 124' X 297' 124' X 252' 174' X 250' 174' X 200' 179' X 290' 168' X 290' 6 Side by Side Helix Double Threaded Helix Single Threaded Helix Side by Side Helix Side by Side Helix Oouble Threaded Heli 7 Ramping System Double Threaded Helix Basement Level (Y/N) n/a Number of Levels Above Grade 4.5 5.5 4 2 2 2 Total Number of Levels 6.5 4 4 4 10 5.5 11 Parking Efficiency Total Parking Ramp Area (SF) 24.500 49.000 166,400 170.200 197.600 189.100 12 179,600 13 Total Street Level Commercial Area (SF) Inside Parking Structure 0 0 0 4,800 0 0 0 14 Total Area (SF) = 24,500 49,000 179,600 171,200 170,200 197,600 189,100 Parking Ramp Efficiency (Sq. Ft./Space) 331 15 310 316 325 338 338 316 Property Status 16 and Ownership Public/Private Public Public Public Public Public Public/Private 17 18 Property Acquisition Issues No No No No No No No 19 Parking Demand in Site Influence Area (2-Blocks in Each Direction) Existing Influence Area Surplus / (Deficit) 20 Estimated Future Influence Area Surplus / (Deficit) 21 22 General Items User Comfort and Convenience of Circulation & Ramping System Okay Excellent Excellent 23 Okay Excellent Okay Good Distance from Elevator to 2nd Ave. & Broadway Central Intersection 1.5 Blocks 1.5 Blocks 4 Blocks 3 Blocks 3 Blocks 3 Blocks 3 Blocks 25 Potential Spin Off Opportunities (H=Housing, I=Institutional, C=Commercial & Retail) None None H, I & C H & C H & C H & C H & C 26 iner Building Floor Area (Levels/Area) 27 28 Concept at Appropriate Contextual Height? Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Architectural Treatment of Sloping Floor Facing Toward Street 29 North & South Side North & South Sides North & South Side: East & West Sides East & West Side None South Side 30 Site Area (If > 1 Acre then On-Site Storm Water Mgmt Required) 1.22 ac 1.03 ac 1.03 ac 1.70 ac 1.70 ac Overhead Electric Power Line Impacts? No No No Yes 31 Yes Future Parking Expansion Capability (Horz, Or Vertical) 32 None None Vert. & Horz. Vert. & Horz. Vert. & Horz Vertical Vertical 33 Traffic Access onvenient Traffic Access for Users? Yes 34 Yes raffic Access Congestion? 35 ntry Lane Street Access 2nd Ave. N 2nd Ave. N 3rd St. N NP Ave. & 8th St. NP Ave. & 8th St. N NP Ave. & 8th St. N NP Ave. & 8th St. I 36 NP Ave. & 8th St. N 3rd St. N NP Ave. & 8th St. N NP Ave. & 8th St. N NP Ave. & 8th St. N Exit Lane Street Access 2nd Ave. N 2nd Ave. N 37 38 Vertical Circulation 39 12% Express (Non-parking) Ramp Area (SF) 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 0% 6.0% 2.0%-5.0% 1.5%-5.9% 3.1%-6.0% 5.7% 5.3% Parking Ramp Slopes 6.0% 41 Floor Elevation of Top Level (Feet) 55.00 66.00 51.00 27.92 39.67 34.00 34.00 Parapet Elevation of Top Level (Feet) 58.75 69.75 54.75 31.67 43.42 37.75 37.75 42 43 Percentage of Area on Non-Ramping Floors @ Typ. Level 30% 30% 36% 31% 40% 24% 51% 0 0 2 0 0 0 0 44 Parking Geometrics & Circulation 45 lumber of Bays 3 46 3 90 Degree 47 Angle of Parking 75 Degree 75 Degree 70/90 Degree 70/90 Degree 75/90 Degree 70 Degree 1 Way 48 -Way or 2-Way Traffic Flow 1 Way 2 Way 1 Way/2 Way 1 Way/2 Way 1 Way/2 Way 1 Way 49 Site Comparative Ranking for Satisfying the Parking Demand of the Downtown Core Parking 51 Site Ranking (1 = Best & 7 = Worst) 3 5 5 5 5 Comments 52 Conceptual Comparative Construction Cost Parking Ramp Construction Cost 52.50 52.50 52.50 85.00 85.00 52.50 52.50 55 Base Parking Ramp Unit Cost (\$/SF)² Premium for Vertical Development (\$/SF) 56 2.75 2.75 2.75 57 \$2,082,500 \$4,165,000 \$9,922,900 \$8,736,000 \$8,935,500 \$10,917,400 \$10,447,775 Street Level Commercial Shell Cost at \$80/SF \$384,000 58 59 26.30 26.30 60 Footprint Area for Below Grade 31,200 43,500 34,800 48,700 51,900 \$1,144,050 Below Grade Cost Premium \$820,560 \$1,280,810 61 \$0 \$0 \$915,240 \$1,364,970 62 Storm Water Management System Allowance (\$250k/acre) \$0 \$0 \$305,000 \$257,500 \$257,500 \$425,000 \$425,000 63 21,300 17,500 17,300 34,100 24,900 Facade Premium Cost at \$30/SF 64 \$0 \$1,023,000 \$639,000 \$747,000 \$525,000 \$519,000 65 Site Work Construction Cost \$0 \$0 \$43,000 \$36,250 \$36,250 \$62,000 \$62,000 Demolition of Parking Lot at \$250/space 66 67 Demolition of Existing Building(s) \$12,114,460 68 Total Parking Ramp Construction Cost = \$2,082,500 \$4,165,000 \$11,196,800 \$10,891,490 \$13,294,370 \$12,734,585 69 Total Parking Ramp Cost per SF = \$65.40 \$67.28 Cost Per Ramp Parking Space (Including Commercial) = \$22,712 70 \$26,361 \$26,871 \$21,907 \$21,610 \$21,237 \$22,263 71 Cost Per Net Parking Space (Including Commercial) = \$29,331 \$28,333 \$31,796 \$32,175 \$30,338 \$35,170 \$39,304 \$1,679,500 \$1,633,700 72 Preliminary Soft Costs (@ 15%)= \$312,400 \$624,800 \$1,817,200 \$1,994,200 \$1,910,200 Owners Construction Phase Contingency (@ 3%) = \$125,000 \$335,900 \$398,800 \$62,500 \$363,400 \$326,700 \$382,000 73 Conceptual Design Cost Contingency (@ 10%) = \$208,300 \$416,500 \$1,211,400 \$1,119,700 \$1,089,100 \$1,329,400 \$1,273,500 \$2,665,700 \$13.940.990 \$17.016.770 74 Total Project Cost = \$5,331,300 \$15,506,460 \$14,331,900 \$16,300,285

Notes:

- ${\bf 1.} \ \ {\bf Excludes\ land\ acquisition\ and\ City\ of\ Fargo\ administration,\ legal,\ and\ financing\ costs.}$
- 2. Assumes March 2016 start of construction.